

Bristol City Council

Minutes of the Development Control A Committee



4 March 2020 at 2.00 pm

Members Present:-

Councillors: Donald Alexander (Chair), Chris Windows (Vice-Chair), Clive Stevens, Fabian Breckels, Paul Goggin, Stephen Clarke, Margaret Hickman, Afzal Shah, Chris Jackson, Steve Smith and Harriet Clough

Officers in Attendance:-

Gary Collins, Laurence Fallon and Claudette Campbell (Democratic Services Officer)

1. Welcome, Introductions and Safety Information

The Chair welcomed those present and explained the process to be followed on the hearing of each application.

The Chair also gave the fire safety notice and read the webcasting statement to those present and participating in public forum.

2. Apologies for Absence and Substitutions

Apologies received from Cllr Mike Davies who was substituted by Cllr Chris Jackson
And Cllr Mark Wright who withdrew from Committee substituted by Cllr Harriet Clough.

3. Declarations of Interest

The Chair asked each member to confirm that they had not been whipped and had not predetermined the applications before them.

The Green Party Members Cllr C Stevens and Cllr S Clarke both confirmed that they had not been involved in the drafting of the statement that had been issued on behalf of the Green Party and that they had not predetermined the application.



4. Appeals

The Head of Development Management introduced the report providing an overview of the current appeals. Highlighting the following:

- a. Item no.40 Trust Headquarters Marlborough Street City Centre Bristol BS2 8CC – Appeal against refusal: The Appeal was dismissed and the decision of the committee was upheld on most grounds. The Inspector considered that the proposed number of parking spaces in the application was not justified; that overproviding car parking would in turn encourage car use; this additional traffic would be detrimental to the local highway safety and the Highway network; there would be negative impact on Air Quality; and also harm to designated and non-designated historic assets.

5. Enforcement

The Head of Development Management was pleased to inform Committee that a number of enforcement notices had been issued.

- There were two notices for 191 Wick Road Bristol; the issues were complicated; the intention is to provide further details to members on the issues at a later date.

6. Minutes of the previous meeting

Resolved – proposed by Cllr Breckels and seconded by Cllr Hickman, that the minutes of the meeting held on the 22nd January 2020 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

7. Public Forum

Members of the Committee received Public Forum Statements in advance of the meeting.

The Statements were heard before the application they related to and were taken fully into consideration by the Committee prior to reaching a decision.

8. 19/05500/P Arnold Laver Brabazon Hangar & Surrounding Land (Arena Site) West Way Bristol BS34 7DU

The Head of Development Management and his representative gave two presentations covering the 4 inter-linked applications that provided an overview of the whole development and detailed the Planning and Transport considerations.



The two presentations are attached to the minutes.

The following was noted from the discussion that arose:

- a. The Project comprises of the following:
 - i. Change of use, refurbishment and external alterations to the Brabazon Hanger Building
 - ii. Construction of a pedestrian bridge over the Henbury Spur railway line, connecting the Brabazon Hanger site to Filton Airfield
 - iii. Demolition of existing 'out buildings' around the Brabazon Hangar and alterations to existing hard-standing area
 - iv. Construction of permanent car parking provision on the airfield site(see b)
 - v. Construction of access roads on the airfield site (see b)
 - vi. Temporary car parking provision on the airfield site
- b. The related planning applications;
 - 19/05823/k South Gloucestershire Council (SGC)for the Land At Charlton Road and West Way Bristol; that deals with matters relating to amendments to the existing highways and highway junction at Charlton Road and West Way and
 - 19/05822/K SGC Land at The Former Filton Airfield; that deals with the formation of a temporary car park for up to 2,000 vehicles
- c. The site is located approximately 7KM north of Bristol City centre at the northern edges of Bristol City Council's administrative boundary. It is bound by the Henbury Loop railway line to the north with the former Filton airfield located beyond this, further to the north within the administrative boundary of South Gloucestershire(SGC). It is bound by the Airbus production site to the east and west, and Filton Golf Club to the south. The surrounding area contains a mix of uses comprising industrial, business, residential and leisure uses.
- d. The central hangar will be redeveloped to provide the main arena, changing from its existing class B8 storage & distribution use to class D2 assembly and leisure use and related changes to provide a range of flexible formats required for different types of events.
- e. With a capacity ranging from 3,312 to 17,080 people reflective of the varied events that will be held on site. Including and not limited to concerts, theatre, family shows and sporting tournaments.
- f. The east hangar will be known as the Festival Hall to include an open flexible open space for exhibitions, trade shows, warm up areas or as additional break out to support activities in the central hangar.
- g. The west hangar will be known as The Hub is to provide a mixture of restaurants, bars family and leisure spaces and office space. In addition to sports and leisure facilities on the ground floors to serve the wider community.
- h. Sustainable transport measures: Joint working is ongoing between BCC and SGC Transport Development Management to provide sustainable transport measures; consider the conditions required by Highways England. All forms of transport is to considered in the plan and measures included to accommodate travel by; coach; rail; park & ride; shuttle bus; Metrobus; and taxi.



- i. The above are accompanied by restrictive measures, including limiting parking on-site and the funding of an event-day controlled parking zone within a 20-30 minute walking time of the development. Further restrictions concern the avoidance of peak periods of traffic demand, clashes with Bristol Rovers fixtures and international cricket matches.
- j. Further obligations include financial contributions towards greater network management in the surrounding area, including CCTV, linked traffic signals, variable message signage and control / command centre management following the completion of a study involving all three highway authorities.
- k. Committee was provided with two detailed presentations giving a full overview of the applications and the Planning and Transport considerations. Both presentations are attached.
- l. Officers recommended approval for referral to the Secretary of State:
 - i. 19/05500/P Arnold Laver Brabazon Hangar & Surrounding Land (Arena Site) West Way Bristol BS34 and
- m. Officers recommend approval subject to s.106 Agreement and appropriate conditions:
 - i. 19/05514/F Arnold Laver Brabazon Hangar (Arena Site) Railway Bridge West Way Bristol BS34 7DU
- n. Officers recommended that Committee offer no objection to the 2 SGC applications as follows:
 - i. 19/05823/k South Gloucestershire Council for the Land At Charlton Road and West Way Bristol and
 - ii. 19/05822/K SGC Land at The Former Filton Airfield.

Questions for Clarification:

1. Members expressed concern about the anticipated reliance on the car as a means to access the proposed arena site, expressed in the presentation as 65% of journeys, and looked to Officers for an explanation.
2. This development, unlike the temple island arena which was located close to city centre car parks, has no existing and available multi-storey car parks. Because of that and a number of other issues, it is expected that the use of the car as a means of transport has the ability to be restricted. Parking on the proposed site is restricted to 2000 cars. Visitors would be encouraged to travel by alternative modes of transport.
3. The proposed Shuttle bus service pick up point is given as the City Centre. This would result in spectators having to travel from across the city to the city centre then out again to the arena. A question was posed on whether any thought had been given to offering shuttle buses from other areas for example St George thereby preventing a large contingent travelling to the central areas to connect with transport for onward travel.
4. The city centre shuttle bus is projected to account for 16% of travel. Previous experience with crowding on the city centre arising from the shuttle bus service for the Massive Attack event demonstrate that a strategy would be needed to manage the flow of spectators around the central area.



5. The operator intends to have appropriate software to capture travel choices for all spectators that links the purchasing of event and travel tickets together. Officers agreed that the ability to forecast and anticipate travel choices would allow the operators to properly forecast visitor travel distances and points of origin that may give rise to the possibility of implementing shuttle bus routes from other locations across the City as an alternative to the city centre.
6. Further explanation was sought on the use of the existing park & ride provision and available capacity. In addition to the possibility of using the park & ride at Brislington.
7. The data capture from the online booking software may also evidence the need to extend the options available for park & ride bus routes and as suggested to other park & ride routes for example from Brislington.
8. Energy & Sustainability: Further explanation was sought on the presentation slide giving details of the Transport CO2 emissions for car journeys to the proposed arena site compared to travel to the 4 existing Arenas that local people would already travel to.
9. The energy and sustainability modelling illustration on car emissions allowed for comparison to be made with regards travel to YTL Arena verses travel to the other 4 major Arena's; London O2; London Wembley, Birmingham; Cardiff; in that YTL Arena events would capture a high percentage of those customers and prevent additional travel beyond the southwest region.
10. The increase reliance on cars was a general concern with questions asked exploring how landowners in the vicinity would be prevented from offering parking to the public attending events at the Arena in particular the retail owners of The Mall Cribbs Causeway.
11. Conditions imposed on the applicant do not extend to conditioning the actions of third parties, that is why it is stated as an ambition that the operator uses their best endeavours to negotiate with related parties such as the owners of The Mall to formulate solutions on a number of issues arising from the operation of the arena.
12. The draft heads of terms set out in Appendix 7 (Agenda item 8(g) page 22 main papers) seeks to ensure that said negotiations relating to essential infrastructure and access routes are completed prior to operation of the arena site.
13. The transport model used evidence from a number 2019 concerts particularly the Massive Attack concert that was held at Filton Airfield; Ashton Gate Summer Concerts; information & intelligence from other Arena venues; it was possible to assess that the Arena in that location will, geographically, draw 63% of its spectators from the South West region.
14. Best endeavour model in respect of the negotiations with the rail operators to increase train seating capacity was noted but a question was asked as what 'plan B' was should negotiations be unsuccessful, what other options were being considered.
15. Rail Travel Endeavour: the modelling is dependent on the wider WECA partnership working together to deliver the required solutions. It is not possible to apply a condition to support these negotiations.



16. To support the negotiations that will deliver the required mode shares and/or to provide alternative solutions to this and other wider transport infrastructure solutions a Transport Steering Group will be set up that will include members from HE, BCC, SGC, Network Rail, YTL & WECA
17. The Transport Steering Group is a requirement and will meet regularly to ensure that all steps are being made to reduce the impact of the arena, whilst ensuring the development meets its transport obligations. The exact Terms of Reference will be laid out in the s106 planning agreement. In the event that 'best endeavours' failed the ultimate sanction would be to reduce capacity of events, but this situation was not in YTL, BCC or WECA's interests.
18. The model shared addressed the impact of the venue from junction 17 but queried why it did not extend to include potential impact to the east of the A38 and A4018. General question on whether mapping had taken place to acknowledge the action of motorist using side roads to avoid the build-up of traffic on the main roads.
19. The comments from Highways England centred around Junctions 16 and 17 and the impact on traffic coming from the motorway network. The assessment outcome indicated that the impact on the A4018 would be negligible with no anticipated overall increase to traffic flow.
20. The Transport Hub will be within the boundary of the airfield site; the intention is to avoid traffic backing-up along the highway and impacting the flow of traffic.
21. Charlton Road: this application is to SGC who's officers, like BCC's are securing that this access will only be available to pedestrians, cyclists and buses through the implementation of bus gates and associated enforcement.
22. The expectation is that trips to the Arena would be a unique travel experience for a specific event and not coupled with a visit to The Mall retail outlet. The majority of hotel accommodation, for those requiring overnight stay, is within the City Centre, there is an anticipated uplift to the central shopping quarter.
23. It is required that spectators would be prompted to state, at the time of booking tickets, their intended mode of travel thereby enabling this information to be fed into a travel plan; the plan includes details on the movement and flow of cars into pre booked spaces for the onsite car park.
24. It was noted that the transport statistics was modelled on 2014 data members enquired as to whether the data would be updated to improve analysis.
25. The 2014 data used for forecasting will be updated as funds become available and further work is undertaken.
26. The provision for disabled visitors accessing the site by taxi was of some concern for members who were aware that the vehicle requirements for Taxis in South Gloucestershire differ to Bristol, where all Bristol taxis are wheelchair accessible those licensed by South Gloucestershire were not. The question was asked on whether conditions would be applied.
27. Officers noted the contribution and comments from members as a helpful guide on understanding the higher standard required by Bristol licensing policy for licensed vehicles that require all vehicles to be accessible, whereas SGC have no such requirement. This would enable further negotiations.



28. Condition 74 Transport Management Plan include conditions relating to the transport hub accessibility to support those with additional needs, to include the ability for wheelchair users to be able to access buses and move around the hub effectively.
29. Concerns were raised that local residents would be asked to pay for any scheme implemented to manage adverse parking from those attending the events at the Arena.
30. Resident Parking: Event Day resident parking scheme and other related waiting restrictions to manage the overspill of parking will be supported from the income generated from enforcement and by the applicant. The parking scheme will be reflective of the conditioned performance start times that aim to avoid known times of commuter traffic.
31. How the remodelling of the building will result in net zero carbon emissions.
32. NET zero carbon functionality of the arena site: The applicants will have in place an Energy strategy to deliver the net zero carbon in line with climate change emergency policy of both BCC & SGC.
33. Assurances were sought that conditions would not be imposed limiting the types of food and beverages available to customers at events.
34. Officers reassured members that they did not anticipate conditioning the types of food & beverages to be sold across the venue.
35. The BREEAM assessment for the water collection use for flushing system was positive but the question was asked why the requirement was so low.
36. BREEAM; the harvesting of rainwater to flush toilets is positive in principle but evidence shows that the management of such systems are complex and expensive resulting in operators abandoning their use. Therefore it is prudent to set the aspiration for the use of such system at a minimum level.
37. Whether the facility would be of added value to the wider local community including those from deprived neighbourhoods and voluntary organisations/groups.
38. Community benefit: Officers noted the suggestion that the wider community particularly those from deprived neighbourhoods should benefit in some way from the development and would look to explore this option further with the applicant.
39. Whether there was a requirement for a counter terrorism strategy to be in place before the granting of planning permission. South Gloucestershire will lead on conditioning appropriately to mitigate hostile vehicles entering the site and jointly to consider the wider issues relating to counterterrorism.
40. Members noted that the plans did not illustrate the pedestrian walking routes into the arena site.
41. All were asked to note that the airfield site boundary, due to its nature has not historically allowed access to its site from within the Bristol area and that this was something that needed to be addressed as part of the arena and also the Cribbs Patchway New Neighbourhood (CPNN)
42. Further clarification on the possible cycle route from the South of the City to the event site was sought where it was indicated that Concorde Way would be the most appropriate, although it was accepted that there was work still to do to make the linkage from Concorde Way to the airfield acceptable. This will require liaison between BCC, SGC and Filton Golf Course, although a s106 contribution has been agreed to improve Charlton Road



Debate:

- a. Cllr Breckels looked to support the applications; noted that more work was required on the transport issues to expand travel choices; look to Officers to provide updates detailing the progress of the transport discussion and asked if this could be conditioned; the application was about re-purposing a building that is unique to Bristol; had no objection to the SGC applications
- b. Officers commented that interim reports on progress could not be conditioned.
- c. Cllr Smith expressed his concerns and disappointment in having the area outside of the city centre; the design and facilities looked good; surprised that money from the city was going into the development but would support.
- d. Cllr Stevens viewed the arena as a great attraction bringing a heritage building back into use; but expressed his concerns about the Highway impact and the lack of assessment of The Mall Cribbs Causeway on the development; was not assured by the talk of best endeavours to mitigate the transport issues; the transport model did not follow the desired walking to cycling to public transport hierarchy but starts with car usage; would consider proposing deferring the application until these matters were resolved; if the best endeavour conversations fails with the owners of Cribbs Causeway what then?
- e. Officers advised that conditions could not be applied to a third party to act in a certain way and/or condition the application reverting back to committee for further consideration on that basis. Members were reminded that they had to consider the application presented in its current form.
- f. Cllr Windows commented that the it was a much needed application but did have concerns; the Massive Attack event did not cause any noise pollution or any impact to transport network but considered that the operation of the arena would greatly affect the Henbury and Brentry areas of Bristol; the prospects of two rail stations if on time would be a welcome boost to the area; Looking to YTL to deliver a ticketing process that captured spectators travel details; noted the considerable thought that had gone into mitigating carbon omissions; looking forward to engaging with SGC Officers; will vote for.
- g. Cllr Clarke advised that he had visited the site and was amazed at the space; supported the repurposing of the existing building; noted the efforts made on the climate emergency issues; but viewed the arena as being in the wrong location because of the impact on the transport network; sited the ambition to increase rail usage; travelling from the South Bristol would be done by car; this would bring too many cars into the area; unable to support the application.
- h. Cllr Stevens looked to officers to condition increase coach journeys and coach parking and offer to those from deprived areas.
- i. Cllr Hickman proposed seconded by Cllr Smith to accept officer's recommendation to grant together with related conditions.
- j. The Chair further outlined the 4 applications that were being considered reminding members that there would be a vote on the 4 individual applications.



- k. 19/05500/P Arnold Laver Brabazon Hangar & Surrounding Land (Arena Site) West Way Bristol BS34 7DU
 - a. Cllr Hickman proposed seconded by Cllr Smith to accept officer's recommendation to grant and refer to Secretary of State.
 - b. When put to the vote
 - c. Resolved (8 for; 2 against; 1 abstention) that the application be approved for referral to the Secretary of State.
- l. 19/05514/F Arnold Laver Brabazon Hangar (Arena Site) Railway Bridge West Way Bristol BS34 7DU
 - a. Cllr Breckels proposed seconded by Cllr Windows
 - b. When put to the vote
 - c. Resolved (9 for; 0 against; 2 abstention) that the application be approved subject to s106 Agreement and Conditions.
- m. 19/05823/K South Gloucestershire Application for the Land at Charlton Road and West Way Bristol
 - a. Cllr Hickman proposed seconded by Cllr Smith
 - b. When put to the vote
 - c. Resolved (9 for; 0 against; 2 abstention) that committee would offer no objection
- n. 19/05822/K South Gloucestershire Application for the Land at the Former Filton Airfield
 - a. Cllr Hickman proposed seconded by Cllr Smith
 - b. When put to the vote
 - c. Resolved (8 for; 2 against; 1 abstention) that committee would offer no objection

9. Appendix 1 - Application Plans

10 Appendix 2 - Environmental Statement - Updated Non-Technical Summary

11 Appendix 3 - Updated Sequential Site Assessment

12 Appendix 4 - Concept of Operations Report

a. Appendix 5 - BCC Transport Development Management Comments

13 Appendix 6 - Draft Conditions

14 Appendix 7 - Draft s106 Heads of Terms

15 19/05514/F Arnold Laver Brabazon Hangar (Arena Site) Railway Bridge West Way Bristol BS34 7DU

The notes above cover this application.



16 19/05823/K South Gloucestershire Application for the Land At Charlton Road And West Way Bristol

The notes above cover this application.

17 19/05822/K South Gloucestershire Application for the Land At The Former Filton Airfield

The notes above cover this application.

18 Date of Next Meeting

26th March 2020 @ 2pm

Meeting ended at 5:40pm

CHAIR _____

